College Management Council – Self-Evaluation Matrix

The following self-evaluation matrix has been produced following two self-evaluation workshops held by the College Management Council Members on Thursday 5 October and Thursday 2 November 2017.

During those two sessions the Members discussed each of the Code of Good Governance criteria, covering:-

- Leadership and Strategy
- Quality of the Student Experience
- Accountability
- Effectiveness
- Relationships and Collaboration

Feedback from the two workshops has been incorporated in to the attached matrix. Members are asked to confirm, or otherwise, the recorded conclusions. The final validated report will be presented to the College Management Council at its meeting on 28 May.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
LEADERSHIP AND STRATEGY		
Board decisions and behaviour reflect the board's Code of Conduct and Nine Principles of Public Life.	1. The CMC operates in line with Orkney Islands Council policies, procedures, financial regulations and the Council scheme of administration. In relation to the last point, matters relating to staffing and finance are referred to the parent committee, Education, Leisure and Housing or other relevant Council committee. The CMC has an informal session to encourage discussion as well as a formal section in which formal decisions are made and recorded.	Student Association business has previously been in the informal session. Members agreed this should move to the formal session to indicate its importance. CMC also agreed that financial updates should always be in the formal session.
We determine the vision, direction, educational character, values and ethos of the college.	2. The CMC has a workshop each year to agree the College strategic and operational plans. This includes a regular review of the vision. CMC met March 2018 to review the 2018-2021 strategic plan.	2. Members reiterated the importance of an annual workshop to review the strategic plan and direction of the College. For a future session on the strategic plan the CMC indicated the desire to have an externally facilitated 'Away day'. Members have identified the need for new members and the importance of induction.

	Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
3.	Our performance management system is adequate, identifying KPIs and we monitor progress.	3. Education Scotland and Quality Assurance Agency reports are presented to, and reviewed by the CMC. Key performance indicators for FE are presented and reviewed annually. Financial performance is reported on at each meeting and the CMC agrees the draft budget before submission to the Council's budget setting process. Audits of FE Credit activity take place annually. Progress against delivery of strategic / operational plan takes place annually and mid-year	3. Financial monitoring has been made a standing item on the CMC agenda. Members appreciate briefings on quality assurance but would prefer more user friendly terms for presentation of information. A quality sub-group of the CMC reviews performance indicators and annual quality report before presentation to the full CMC.
4.	Relevant stakeholders are engaged in compiling the outcome agreement.	4. A single outcome agreement is produced for the Highlands and Islands covering both the Further and Higher Education work of the region. The FE components are approved by the FE Regional Board and presented along with the HE components to the University Court. Orkney College contributes to the development of the plan largely through the engagement of College staff with working groups in UHI including the Senior Managers	 2 new 'business' Members and 3 community Members have been recruited to improve stakeholder representation. Members are keen to ensure that business people are engaged with, even if they do not have time to become Members.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
5. We provide leadership on othics	Curriculum Team, Partnership Planning Forum, Partnership Council etc. The aim is to have a representative membership of the CMC. There has been a shortage of business and community Members	5. The CMC acknowledges that the
5. We provide leadership on ethics, equalities, diversity and staff welfare in keeping with Council policies and procedures.	5. The College complies with Council wide ethics, equalities, diversity and staff welfare in keeping with Council HR policies and procedures. In addition UHI operates an ethics committee for considering any research work undertaken by staff or students in the UHI partnership to ensure that ethical standards are maintained. The College has produced equality and diversity plans aimed at improvement and these are brought to the CMC. The CMC has an under representation of female Members.	5. The CMC acknowledges that the profile of Councillors in terms of gender split is limited by the very small number of female Councillors. It is outwith the ability of the CMC to influence the appointment of elected Councillors. Appointment of new Members provided an opportunity to redress the balance – All those that applied were appointed and this has increased the female membership, however there continues to be an imbalance, which will require further work. Uptake of student numbers on courses which have traditionally been either male or female dominated are ongoing issues that staff seek to redress. The CMC has requested to be kept briefed on equality monitoring across the College

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
We have regard to the social and economic needs of our area.	6. The CMC members are drawn from the Elected Members of the Council, recruited members from the business community and recruited members from the community more widely. In addition student members are taking a greater role in the business of the CMC, which is a positive indicator. There have been vacancies in the business community and wider community membership, however 3 community Members and 2 business Members have recently been appointed	6. The CMC have indicated that Councillor Members of the CMC should include at least one Councillor from the smaller isles. The next opportunity for this to be considered will be the Councillor appointments review next due in May/June 2019.
QUALITY OF THE STUDENT EXPERIENCE		
The voice of students and the quality of their experience is central to our decisions including monitoring student surveys and any resulting action plans.	The College and UHI have strengthened the engagement with students through the establishment of the new Highlands & Islands Student Association 2 years ago, which included a part-time sabbatical post in Orkney. This has seen a significant increase in student engagement in the CMC	1. Student surveys should in future be reported to the CMC. The new post of Student Engagement Officer (North), based in Orkney will be beneficial. CMC Members expressed the view that they would in future wish to see student matters included in the formal part of the CMC meeting.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
2. We have open ongoing engagement with students, working in partnership and encouraging a strong independent student association having regard to the Student Association Framework.	and the activity of 'Student Reps' in the College. At present student surveys are reviewed by College managers but have not routinely been reported to the CMC. Student members have a standing item on the informal CMC agenda. There has been increased input from student members to CMC meetings. Student engagement directly with College Management Team members is seen as a positive by students. 2. The Highlands and Islands Student Association was established 2 years	2. Student Members are keen to act as Ambassadors to give student applicants a balanced feel for what being a student at Orkney College is like, including going in to schools.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
3. Our Student Association is adequately resource, operates fairly and in a democratic manner, fulfilling its duties; it has a written constitution that the board has reviewed in the last five years.	3. HISA is supported in Orkney by a part-time sabbatical officer funded by the College. Elections are held annually for the local 'HISA Depute President'. The written constitution of HISA has been produced by UHI (by earlier agreement with the academic partners) and Orkney College seeks to resource HISA locally in line with UHI guidance. Annual funding is provided to local HISA branches but it is acknowledged that the level of funds currently provided are modest compared with many large universities south.	3. Discussions with HISA Officer and student Reps will help inform future priorities.
4. We are aware of and foster good relationships with partner organisations that help us provide coherent learning, including employability. Output Description:	4. There are good links between the various agencies in Orkney that support coherent learning and the College is an enthusiastic and active partner in the Orkney Offer. The College works closely with junior high and secondary schools; Skills Development Scotland; CONNECT; Employability Orkney; Job Centre Plus; Developing Young Workforce Board; Community	4. Members of the CMC are themselves linked in to partner organisations through a combination of board and committee memberships. CMC Members identified that a register of links with partner organisations would be beneficial. Making use of this intelligence is invaluable. 3 new Community Members and 2 new Business Members will strengthen

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	Planning Partnership; Learning Link and various third sector bodies aimed at improving people's life chances.	business and community engagement. The importance of links with the Learning Link and Developing the Young Workforce Board were identified and will be facilitated by some CMC Members being directly involved with the DYW Board.
Mechanisms ensure effective oversight of quality and inclusiveness of learning.	5. The CMC receives information annually on courses run by the College. The CMC holds a workshop each year to review and update the strategic plan which includes details of new programmes proposed/being developed and any programmes which are proposed to be withdrawn. During this process Members have the opportunity to both challenge and make recommendations in regard to the curriculum. Annual quality reports along with quality performance indicators are considered by the CMC.	5. The Quality sub-group of the CMC needs to be reconstituted to take advantage of the change in CMC members. Student surveys will in future be reported to the CMC through the appropriate Sub-committee reporting procedures. The availability of CMC papers to be publicised more widely to students. CMC reports and minutes are publicly available on the Council Website but work to be done to encourage students to look at them and contribute.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
ACCOUNTABILITY		
 We fulfil our primary accountability to our funding body by: Delivering our outcome agreement. Fulfilling our statutory duty and terms of our grant. 	1. As noted the outcome agreement for our region covers FE and HE and all academic partners within UHI as a single agreement. Over the last 3 years Orkney College has met its obligations under the outcome agreement. The statutory duties are measured through a number of reports to Scottish Funding Council such as equalities, climate control, financial memorandum etc.; and other statutory duties that are delivered through compliance with Orkney Islands Council's Policies and procedures. These include those related to HR and finance which are monitored through a combination of audit and Council committee reporting, in a number of cases at Council wide level, rather than Orkney College specific.	1. Minutes of the formal CMC meeting are reported to the Education, Leisure and Housing Committee. Arrangements need to be put in place to ensure that all members know how to access the minute of meetings, once these are available. The requirement to ensure that the College complies with new data protection regulations was discussed. This will be achieved through compliance with Orkney Islands Council and University of the Highlands and Islands compliance frameworks.
We fulfil our accountability to students, public, employers and our community for provision of education that enhances	The strategic / operational plans for the College set out what the College aims to deliver in the coming three	There are a number of publications by SFC, Education Scotland and QAA that are published and the

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
social and economic wellbeing.	years. Progress monitoring against the plan is undertaken six monthly, with annual review / update. Key performance indicators are produced annually and published on the College website. The Scottish Funding Council and Education Scotland produce reports on the effectiveness of delivery of the sector on a rolling basis and these are published. These reports often include performance data at a regional and local level.	College does not routinely circulate all of these to all Members. These could be made available more widely and might help with accountability. CMC minutes – note as above.
We manage conflicts of interest and disclose our register of interests.	3. The Council operates a register of interests for all Elected Members of the Council. All Members of the College Management Council are also required to declare in writing any interests on a self-disclosure basis. Members absent themselves from business where there is an 'interest' covered by the Councillors' Code of Conduct, published by the Standards Commission.	Conflicts of interest declared at the start of all business.
Our decision making is transparent, informed, rigorous and timely and associated documentation is adequate.	4. For all reports considered by the CMC there is a presumption that business will be conducted in public	Informal section of CMC to be retitled "Briefing Meeting" and ensure all key business is contained within

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	unless there is a legal reason not to. If a report contains potentially "exempt information" advice is sought from the Council's legal services and any decision to exclude the public takes place at the meeting. All formal decision making by the CMC (and all other Council Committees) is supported by officer prepared reports and subject to scrutiny by members before any decision is made. In the case of the CMC matters relating to staffing decisions and budget are not delegated to the CMC and will be considered by the parent committee (Education, Leisure and Housing) or other relevant Council committee.	formal public meetings. Consideration was also given to the possibility of advertising CMC meetings on Radio Orkney. This to be investigated further, although previous attempts to promote Council meetings in this way in the past have not always been successful.
 5. We operate within the scheme of delegation of the Council and appropriately delegate responsibilities within the College. We ensure compliance with the Council's requirement in terms of: a. audit, remuneration, finance and nominations/appointments. b. the College staff / Council Officers 	5. As noted the College is subject to Council Policies and Procedures and the scheme of administration and the scheme of delegation of the Council. In addition there is decision making devolved to the College by UHI but throughout that process the CMC is still required to operate within the procedures of the	5. The College operates within the scheme of delegation and the scheme of administration of Orkney Islands Council which is designed to ensure a high level of auditable accountability. The scheme of delegation and the scheme of administration of the Council has been recently updated, with the

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
charged with advising the CMC are clear. c. Committee minutes go to the next meeting of the CMC, and are reported upwards to other relevant Council Committees, in accordance with Council policies and procedures.	Council.	most significant change for the CMC being that staffing matters are now reported directly to the Education, Leisure and Housing Committee, rather than the Human Resources Sub-committee.
6. We set the risk appetite, balancing risk and opportunity and this is known to senior staff.	6. The College maintains a risk register that is reported on to the CMC twice per annum or more frequently as requested. The format of this risk register is consistent with that used across the UHI partnership and the Orkney College Risk Register feeds in to the UHI Risk Register. The senior management team consult with the CMC on all new major developments and in all cases where there is potential risk or additional financial resources are required. Agreement to engage in any new venture involving risk requires support through the senior officer management structure of the Council as well as any approval sought through the governance structure. Managing risk is key at all	6. Members indicated that they are comfortable that they are sufficiently informed about the level of risk associated with CMC decision making. Output Description:

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	levels of decision making.	
We ensure sound risk management and supporting review systems.	7. As 6 above.	7. Members indicated that they are comfortable that they are sufficiently informed about the level of risk associated with CMC decision making.
8. The CMC operates within the remit of its Constitution and Council Committee policies and procedures. The College and actions of the CMC are accountable to the Council's Audit Committee.	8. The CMC operates within the remit of its constitution and meetings are conducted in accordance with Council Standing Orders. A Council Committee Officer supports the conduct of the meeting and advises appropriately. All formal CMC reports are prepared in accordance with the Council's reporting format and framework ensuring consistency across committees. The Committees Officer advises the Chair on Council procedural matters.	8. Members felt that all had received appropriate induction. With 5 new members joining a further round of induction will be provided. UHI is also planning a standard induction for all UHI partner Board members. Need to ensure that all Members feel that they can appropriately contribute to decision making. Councillors are well appraised of and embedded in Council procedures but effort must be made to ensure that all other members are empowered to contribute effectively.
9. We ensure our body's sustainability, including compliance with the Council's Financial Regulations, SFC Financial Memorandum and the Scottish Public Finance Manual, ensuring adequate	9. The College complies with the SFC Financial Memorandum, with a number of agreed variations determined by the fact that the College is a service of a local	9. Members of the CMC feel that they receive sufficient financial information to satisfy themselves that they are fulfilling their obligations to monitoring the

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
reporting and monitoring and economic, efficient and effective use of our funds.	authority and not a separate legally constituted body in its own right. Staff in the college are required to comply with the Council Financial Regulations. Compliance with the Council Financial Regulations ensures that the College is also complying with the Scottish Public Sector Finance Manual. Financial monitoring is undertaken by senior staff in the College and reported to the CMC at each meeting. The College reports monthly to Elected Members, along with all Council Services/functions on progress against the annual budget. The College is required to balance income and expenditure on an annual basis, with the budget being agreed by the Council through the annual budget setting process.	efficient and effective use of funds.
10. The College Management Council takes full account of the employer obligations of the Council in relation to staff at the College.	10. The CMC, as a sub-committee of the Education, Leisure and Housing Committee is kept informed of staffing matters and has an interest in staffing matters however there is no Council delegation for the CMC to make formal decisions on staffing	10. Members are aware of the duties and obligations associated with the College Management Council being a sub-committee of the Education Leisure and Housing Committee of Orkney Islands Council. Council Officers attend CMC meetings to

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	matters. These are referred to the Education, Leisure and Housing Committee. The CMC does play an important role in the interface of decision making with staff and this is recognised by staff attendance at meetings.	advise Members.
EFFECTIVENESS		
The College Management Council Chair provides leadership and ensures board effectiveness, working well with the principal and board secretary.	1. The CMC Chair is elected by the CMC Members with a constitutional requirement that at least one of the posts of Chair or Vice Chair must be held by an elected Councillor. The role of the Chair is defined by Council Standing Orders and formal meetings take place in keeping with these Standing orders. Committees Officers are on hand to advise the Chair on Standing Orders and Council Policy / Procedure.	Members recognise that the role of Chair has in the past and will continue to be a key role in the governance of the College. The current Chair is in their first year of Office. Members are positive about the role of the Chair going forward.
2. Our CMC and any sub-committees have the right balance of skills, experience, independence and knowledge of the college to fulfil their role effectively.	2. This is a challenging question to answer at this point as some of the Members are new and the College is about to recruit to fill a shortfall in community and business	2. Members felt that although the balance of skills and experience within the CMC was good, there were some gaps due to a number of vacancies. 3 new Community

	Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
		community members.	Members and 2 new Business Members have now been recruited which will broaden the expertise available to the CMC.
3.	We abide by collective responsibility, taking decisions in the interests of the body and managing conflicts of interest appropriately.	3. The concept of collective responsibility is well understood by Members, however the challenge can come from the breadth of constituencies that Members embrace. In the case of Elected Members of the Council responsibility rests to consider the wider implications for the Council as well as the specific implications for the College. For community and business community Members it may be more straightforward to act predominantly with the interests of the College in mind.	3. Members understand the requirement of collective responsibility and are keen to engage in open discussion regarding decision making. Nevertheless Members believe that it is important to restate at each meeting the importance of placing the College (including interests of the students) at the centre of decision making.
4.	Staff and student members are encouraged to fully engage in the business of the board, whilst recognising the specific requirements of the Council in terms of voting procedures.	4. Students have a standing item on the informal CMC agenda to encourage feedback at each meeting on student matters. Staff and Student Members are able to request items to be discussed at informal parts of the meeting and can seek advice from the Principal	4. Staff and Student representatives regularly attend the CMC. As the College is part of a local authority the constitution does not allow staff representatives to have a vote as they are Council employees. This is a unique situation relating to the College being part of the Council

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	on the specific reporting style requirements.	and applies to the Principal as well. Members are keen that the staff and student voice is heard and is seeking to raise the profile of student contributions further.
5. We have an open and transparent process for recruiting and setting the performance measures for our principal in accordance with Council policies and procedures.	5. The Principal is appointed in accordance with Council HR Policy and Procedure which for a post at this level will include Member representation on the appointments panel. The Principal is subject to the Council's Employee Review and Development process which includes annual agreed targets and is conducted with the Head of Schools, Curriculum and Lifelong Learning.	5. Members understand that the Principal is a Council employee and subject to normal Council policies and procedure. The job role of the Principal sets out the requirement for the post holder to act as advisor to the CMC but also to implement the CMC strategy in the operation of the College.
6. There is a clear understanding of the responsibilities delegated to the principal and the respective roles of the chair, board members and executive staff.	6. The Principal is responsible for the operational elements of the strategic plan and the day to day running of the College. The CMC is a sub-committee of the Education Leisure and Housing Committee and has governance responsibility for the College. The Principal reports to the Head of Schools, Curriculum and Lifelong Learning,	6. Members have indicated that they would appreciate further clarity on the governance role of the CMC. This is particularly the case for non-Councillors who are not directly involved in the parent Education, Leisure and Housing Committee, other Council Committees and 'Full Council'. The complexity and different accountabilities of

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
	who reports to the Executive Director of Education Leisure and Housing, who reports to the Chief Executive of the Council.	Members within the Council is a direct consequence of the non-incorporated status of the College – it is an Orkney Islands Council service, rather than a separate public body. Induction will be arranged for all non-Councillor' Members to ensure that they are adequately informed of Council governance arrangements.
 7. The board secretary is: a. appointed by the Council with the appropriate skills and experience and is not a member of the senior management team in any other capacity. b. available to advise all board members and committees and has adequate time to fulfil the role. 	7. The College Management Council is supported by a Committees Officer of the Council who provides guidance on the conduct of CMC meetings, in accordance with Council Standing Orders, and decision making. As the CMC is a formal Council Sub-Committee as opposed to an incorporated body, the CMC operates as a Sub-Committee to the Education, Leisure and Housing Committee within the wider Council Committee structure with final decisions on key matters resting with the full Council.	7. The College Management Council is supported by Council Officers from Human Resources, Finance, Legal Services and a Committees Officer. This ensures a good level of advice regarding Council governance procedures and helps ensure compliance. The Council Officers are non-voting. As a local authority owned college, Orkney College has a different legal status to most other colleges in Scotland and this is reflected in the specific governance arrangements in place.

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
8. We have a formal and open board member recruitment process that reflects the Committee member appointment processes of the Council.	8. Elected Members of the Council are elected by the population of Orkney and then appointed to Council Committees and Sub-Committees by a process of voting by Members. Community and Business Community Member vacancies are advertised openly, requesting applications. Applicants are then interviewed by a panel of existing Members following a procedure agreed in advance of application. This is intended to provide a transparent process of appointment / recruitment of Members.	8. Whilst the process of appointing Elected Councillors to serve on the Sub-Committee is established and outwith review here, the CMC is responsible for the process of recruiting the 'Business' and 'Community' members, although these appointments are then subject to approval by the Full Council. Following successful advertisement and recruitment 3 new Community members and 2 new Business members are joining the CMC and represent a good range of stakeholder interest.
9. We have appropriate arrangements for student and staff member recruitment. Output Description:	9. The Orkney HISA Depute, elected by student vote in the College holds one place on the CMC and a further place is provided for appointment by the student body. Two staff members, Business Support and Academic are appointed by staff vote. Staff and student members do not have a formal vote in meetings.	9. A new staff member is currently being elected to replace one of the two staff members on the CMC. Staff members are appointed by a process of nomination and voting open to all staff members. There is one member drawn from the academic staff of the college and one from the business support staff.
10. All members undertake training tailored to their needs (including committee training), new members receive formal induction	Elected Members of the Council are subject to a full induction process to their roles as	10. UHI is currently developing Board Member training for the UHI partnership. This is likely to be a

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
tailored to their needs and there are records of training.	Councillors. All new Members are inducted but there needs to be more formal recording of training undertaken than previously. Colleges Scotland offers training for College Board members, although this is usually provided on the Scottish mainland and does not recognise the unique governance arrangements for a Council owned college compared with the incorporated body status held by almost all other colleges in Scotland.	useful part of new member induction, but again will need to pay cognisance to the specific nature of a local authority based college.
11. We review the board's effectiveness annually using a robust self-evaluation process, externally facilitated at least every three years.	11. This will be the first time that the College Management Council has reviewed its effectiveness using a self-evaluation process.	11. Self-evaluation of the College Management Council will take place on an annual basis going forward.
RELATIONSHIPS AND COLLABORATION		
 We work in partnership at a local, regional and national level to: secure coherent education provision in our locality. achieve commonly agreed outcomes. develop agreed priorities. 	Orkney College UHI is both a partner in the University of the Highlands and Islands and a service of Orkney Islands Council. Locally the College works in partnership with a range of bodies and agencies	The College is a partner in the University of the Highlands and Islands and part of the Highlands and Islands Regional College. Through these partnerships planning is undertaken at both a

Appendix 2

Code of Good Governance Criteria	Our performance in the last 12 months (including evidence)	Development required during the next year
d. address local needs as well as national priorities and specialisms.	providing education and training across all SCQF levels from school work to PhD. Regionally and nationally the College offers a range of Higher Education courses through either study in Orkney or blended delivery to the rest of Scotland and in some cases internationally.	local and regional level to achieve the criteria set out in the Code of Good Governance in the first column.